

Iyun Halacha is sponsored by the Dr. Philip & Mrs. Leah Mehler Family Foundation

In memory of their parents Dr. Irving & Mrs. Bernice Mehler & Mr. Gedalja & Mrs. Miriam Zupnik

לעילוי נשמת ר' יצחק מאיר בן אליהו ובריינא בת אברהם ע"ה ור' גדליה בן אברהם מנחם הכהן ומרים בת ישראל ע"ה

Drinking the Kiddush Wine

Rosh Kollel Harav Shachne Sommers shlita

How much of the kiddush cup must be drunk?

Who is supposed to drink the kiddush wine?

The sources: Every Shabbos and Yom Tov, we make *kiddush* on a cup of wine. The Gemara (Shabbos 76b) teaches that the cup upon which *kiddush* is made must contain the volume of a *revi'is*¹. Subsequently, there is a requirement to drink a minimum amount of wine from the cup. The Gemara (Pesachim 107a) tells us that one who makes *kiddush* is *yotzei* (fulfills his obligation) if he drinks *milo lugmav*, a cheekful, but if he does not drink at least that much, he is not *yotzei*.

Based on this, the Mishna Berura (271:13; Bi'ur Halacha s.v. *tzarich*; Sha'ar Hatziyun 271:53) rules that one who does not drink a *milo lugmav* has not fulfilled the mitzvah of *kiddush* even *bidieved* (after the fact), and so it's particularly important to be careful in this regard².

The Shulchan Aruch (271:14) cites a *machlokes* (dispute) regarding who can drink the *milo lugmav*. The first opinion is that any one person can drink the *milo lugmav*. The second opinion is that the *milo lugmav* can be fulfilled by combining the drinking of multiple people. The third opinion, that of the Geonim, is that the person making *kiddush* must drink the *milo lugmav* himself.

The Shulchan Aruch says that one should preferably fulfill the opinion of the Geonim. Additionally, the Shulchan Aruch says that it is best if all of the assembled taste a bit of the *kiddush* wine. Accordingly, it would be best for the one making *kiddush* to drink a *milo lugmav* and for everyone else to drink a bit. *Bidieved*, the Mishna Berura (271:73) rules that one may rely on the opinion that even a combined *milo lugmav* suffices.

How much is *milo lugmav*?: The Gemara (Yuma 80a-b) discusses *milo lugmav* in the context of the minimum amount one must drink on Yom Kippur to be liable to *kareis*. From that discussion it emerges that *milo lugmav* for the average person is less than a *revi'is*. The Ran (Yuma 3a *biDapei haRif* s.v. *vihashoseh*; quoted in Bais Yosef Orach Chaim 612) writes that it is unclear exactly how much "less than a *revi'is*" is, and accordingly one needs to be concerned that it is only slightly less than a *revi'is*. However, Tosafos (Pesachim 107a s.v. *im*) say it is the majority of a *revi'is*. Tosafos base this on the Gemara (Pesachim 109b) which says, regarding the four cups of the Pesach Seder, that one must drink the majority of the cup. In the laws of *kiddush*, the Shulchan Aruch (ibid.:13) follows Tosafos' opinion and rules that the amount for *milo lugmav* is a *rov revi'is* (majority of a *revi'is*). However, in the laws of Yom Kippur, the Shulchan Aruch (ibid. 612:9) writes that a *milo lugmav* of an average person is less than a *revi'is*. This seems to follow the opinion of the Ran that it is unclear how much less than a *revi'is* is a *milo lugmav* is.

The Bi'ur Halacha (171:13 s.v. *vihu*) addresses the apparent contradiction and says that for the laws of *kiddush*, where the drinking of *milo lugmav* is a Rabbinic obligation, the Shulchan Aruch follows the more lenient approach of Tosafos that a *rov revi'is* is *milo lugmav*. In the laws of Yom Kippur, however, the Shulchan Aruch is discussing the point at which one has violated the fast

¹ Lit., "a quarter;" i.e., a quarter of a *lug* (a measure of volume).

² See, however, Aruch Hashulchan (271:30), who disagrees. See also Sha'ar Hatziyun 271:53 citing Elya Rabba.

of Yom Kippur and is liable to *kareis*. The Shulchan Aruch must provide the amount for which one has certainly violated this restriction, and thus cites the larger amount of less than a *revi'is*.

In any event, the Shulchan Aruch indicates that if one drinks the majority of a *revi'is* for *kiddush*, one can generally assume that amount is sufficient. However, the Mishna Berura (271:68), citing the Magen Avraham and others, rules that this is only true for an average-size person. However, someone who is *gadol biyoser*, very large, must drink a larger amount, sufficient to fill his larger cheek.

This concept is based on the Gemara (Yuma 80a-b), which is codified in Shulchan Aruch (ibid. 612:9) in the laws of Yom Kippur, that the *shiur* of *milo lugmav* is relative, and someone of the size of Og the king of Bashan (described by the Torah as being of massive size) would require a much larger amount for a *milo lugmav*. Similarly, someone with a smaller-than-average cheek would require a smaller amount.

It is interesting to note another discrepancy regarding the measuring of *milo lugmav* between the laws of Yom Kippur and those of *kiddush*. Regarding Yom Kippur, the Shulchan Aruch (618:7) writes that if one is ill and needs to drink on Yom Kippur to preserve his life, he should, if possible, limit his drinking to less than a *milo lugmav* at a time. In that context, the Shulchan Aruch says that one should measure one's cheek before Yom Kippur to find out how large his cheekfull is. In the laws of *kiddush*, however, no such recommendation is made.

This distinction seems to go hand in hand with the one mentioned previously. In the laws of *kiddush*, the Shulchan Aruch gives a clear measurement for *milo lugmav* – *rov revi'is* – and so no personal measuring is necessary. For Yom Kippur, however, the Shulchan Aruch gives no clear measurement, just that it is somewhat less than a *revi'is*. The exact amount therefore requires an actual measurement to ascertain how much one's cheek holds.

There may be another simple reason for the distinction. An ill person on Yom Kippur is faced with the conflict between the imperative to fast and the overriding need to protect one's life. It is therefore not recommended to rely on the general rule that the majority of a *revi'is* equals *milo lugmav*; rather, it is necessary to determine the exact amount of one's personal *milo lugmav* in order to know the maximum one may drink. For *kiddush*, however, one may rely on the general rule that a *rov revi'is* is sufficient, unless one is particularly large³.

The size of a *revi'is* and the practical halacha: Having established that *milo lugmav* is a *rov revi'is*, we must now ascertain the measurement of a *revi'is*. The Mishna Berura (271:68), citing the Gemara, tells us that a *revi'is* is equal to the volume of 1 1/2 eggs (including the shell). Contemporary measurements (see Laws of Pesach by Rabbi Shimon Eider pg. 229; Laws of Kezayis by Rabbi Pinchos Bodner pg. 24) find that average-size eggs have the approximate volume of 2 fl. oz. This would make a *revi'is* approximately 3 fl. oz. and *milo*

³ See further for another possible reason why the Shulchan Aruch does not require measuring one's mouth to determine the *milo lugmav* for *kiddush* and merely states that *rov revi'is* suffices.

lugmav just over 1.5 fl. oz.⁴

However, the Mishna Berura (ibid.) cites the opinion of the Tzelach who maintained that contemporary eggs are smaller than the ones referenced by the Gemara and cannot be used for determining the size of a *revi'is*. Rather, one must use an alternative method of measuring mentioned in the Gemara (Pesachim 109), which determines a *revi'is* based on the size of fingers. Contemporary measurements based on that method have yielded a result of approximately 4.5 fl. oz., which would make a *milo lugmav* approximately 2.3 fl. oz. The Bi'ur Halacha (271:13 s.v. *shel*) maintains that for Friday night *kiddush*, which is a *diOrayso* (Torah-level) obligation, one should be stringent and follow the opinion of the Tzelach, but for daytime Shabbos *kiddush* (and Yom Tov in general, whose *kiddush* obligation is Rabbinic according to most opinions [see Kol Dodi Haggadah pg. 12]), one may follow the lenient opinion to rely on the volume of contemporary eggs.

It would follow that on Friday night, one should use a cup which holds the larger *revi'is* of 4.5 fl. oz. and drink 2.3 fl. oz., while for Shabbos day and Yom Tov, it is sufficient to use a cup holding 3 fl. oz. and to drink 1.6 fl. oz.

Issue with the measurement: However, there is an issue regarding this ruling. As discussed earlier, the measurement of *rov revi'is* as the amount of *milo lugmav* is not absolute. One who has larger cheeks would actually need to drink more than that, relative to his cheek size. Based on this, if it would be determined that the average size of people has grown, and now the average cheekfull is more than a *rov revi'is*, it stands to reason that it would be necessary to drink more.

This is not merely a theoretical possibility. The Bi'ur Halacha (ibid.) records that he measured the cheeks of average-sized people, and some of them contained the volume of one egg⁵. Using this information, it would seem that in the days of the Chofetz Chaim, *milo lugmav* for an average size person was actually close to 2 fl. oz.

According to this, one should be careful, even by the daytime Shabbos *kiddush*, to drink 2 fl. oz. and not just a majority of the 3 oz. *revi'is*. However, the generally accepted opinion seems to be that a *rov revi'is* suffices. This follows the straightforward reading of the Shulchan Aruch in the laws of *kiddush*, which makes no mention of the possibility of *milo lugmav* being more than *rov revi'is*.

There are two possible ways of resolving the issue of the Bi'ur Halacha's measurements. Firstly, the Chazon Ish (39:15) questions the Bi'ur Halacha method of measurement; accordingly, there would be no grounds to assume that the average *milo lugmav* has changed⁶.

A second approach is that the opinion of the Magen Avraham and the Mishna Berura that a larger person needs to drink the size of his own cheekful (which is more than a *rov revi'is*) is not agreed with by many Rishonim and *poskim*, and so the *minhag ha'blam* (common custom) does not follow this position. Let us explain.

Tosafos and the Ran do say that a larger person would need to drink more, as

⁴ Rabbi Dovid Feinstein in his Kol Dodi Haggadah (pg. 13) measures a *revi'is* as either 2.9 or 3.3 fl. oz.

⁵ The Bi'ur Halacha says that he actually measured both cheeks, (for reasons beyond the scope of this discussion), and found they held two eggs'-volume of liquid, but he assumes that *milo lugmav* equals half of that amount.

⁶ See also the Kol Dodi Haggadah pg. 14 which states that Rabbi Moshe Feinstein determined that a contemporary *milo lugmav* is $\frac{1}{2}$ - $\frac{3}{4}$ fl. oz. This contradicts the Bi'ur Halacha's measurements.

discussed earlier. It is striking, however, that the Rosh, Tur and Shulchan Aruch all just say that *milo lugmav* is *rov revi'is* and make no mention of the fact that it actually varies and could be more for a larger person. The later authorities - Chayei Adam, Kitzur Shulchan Aruch and Aruch Hashulchan - follow suit and simply say that the *milo lugmav* that must be drunk is *rov revi'is*. This strongly indicates that they do not agree with the Magen Avraham and they hold that *rov revi'is* is sufficient even for a larger person.

The problem with all this is the aforementioned Gemara in Yuma that clearly says that *milo lugmav* is relative to the size of the person. This issue can be resolved based on the words of the Ran, which are quoted in Mishna Berura.

Assuming that *milo lugmav* of a large person requires him to drink more, what would the halacha be if there is an exceedingly large person whose *milo lugmav* exceeds a *revi'is*? The Mishna Berura (271:68,) quoting the Ran, says that in such a case it would suffice to drink the entire cup, which is a *revi'is*, even though it is less than *milo lugmav*.

We see from the Ran that the requirement of drinking *milo lugmav* is not absolute; one can either drink *milo lugmav*, or drink the entire *revi'is*, whichever is less. The idea seems to be that one must drink a significant amount from the *kiddush* cup, and there are two types of "significant drinking," either a *milo lugmav* or the entire *revi'is*.

This is true according to the opinion of the Ran, who clearly says that an extremely large person would need to drink the entire *revi'is*, not just a majority.

However, it can be suggested that the Rosh, Tur and Shulchan Aruch use a similar rationale, but with one difference. Instead of the Ran's approach that drinking the entire *revi'is* is the maximum amount that would be considered significant, they rule that drinking *rov revi'is* is the maximum necessary. This is based upon the rule of *rubo kikulo*, that a majority of a whole is considered like the whole.

According to this approach, even a very large person, whose *milo lugmav* is much more than *rov revi'is*, would not need to drink more than *rov revi'is*, because by drinking the majority of the *revi'is*, it is considered that he drank the entire *revi'is*, which is sufficient to be considered significant even if it's less than *milo lugmav*.

This approach would explain the two differences found in Shulchan Aruch between the laws of Yom Kippur and *kiddush*. Regarding Yom Kippur, the Shulchan Aruch indicates that *milo lugmav* is relative, and he also follows the Ran that *milo lugmav* may be more than *rov revi'is*. For *kiddush*, however, the Shulchan Aruch says that *rov revi'is* suffices and makes no mention of it being relative. Based upon the above premise, it can be said that the opinion of the Shulchan Aruch for *kiddush* is that the absolute maximum one is required to drink is *rov revi'is*, because that is considered a significant drinking of the cup and suffices even if it is less than *milo lugmav*. For Yom Kippur, however, the *shiur* of *milo lugmav* is based upon factors related to how much liquid would impact the person's fast, and so the notion of an absolute, non-relative significant amount, as well as the idea of *rubo kikulo*, are both irrelevant.

In any event, the optimal way to fulfill the obligation to drink the *kiddush* wine is that the person making *kiddush* should drink the majority of a *revi'is*; for Friday night, a *revi'is* is 4.5 fl. oz. and its majority equals 2.3 fl. oz., and at all other times, the *revi'is* is 3 fl. oz. and its majority is 1.6 fl. oz. However, a particularly large person would need to drink somewhat more than these amounts according to the ruling of the Mishna Berura. In addition, ideally, all of the assembled should taste a bit of the wine as well.

Points to Ponder

Is it preferable to have someone who is able to drink melo lugmav on his own make kiddush rather than someone who cannot?

How long does one have to drink the milo lugmav?

*Iyun Halacha is a publication of the Denver Community Kollel
Please consult with a qualified halachic authority for all practical questions of halacha*

Halachic Editor: Rabbi Shachne Sommers · General Editor: Rabbi Mordechai Fleisher

5080 W. 14th Ave, Denver, CO 80204 · 303-820-2855 · info@denverkollel.org · www.denverkollel.org

To receive Halacha Weekly by email, contact info@denverkollel.org