

Iyun Halacha is sponsored by the Dr. Philip & Mrs. Leah Mehler Family Foundation

In memory of their parents Dr. Irving & Mrs. Bernice Mehler & Mr. Gedalja & Mrs. Miriam Zupnik

לעילוי נשמת ר' יצחק מאיר בן אליהו ובריינא בת אברהם ע"ה ור' גדליה בן אברהם מנחם הכהן ומרים בת ישראל ע"ה

Kiddush in Shul on Friday Night

Rabbi Chaim Yeshia Freeman

What is the source for reciting kiddush in shul on Friday night?

What is the proper procedure for this recitation?

Source for the custom: There is a custom in many communities that *kiddush* is recited on Friday night in shul at the end of services. There is a great deal of discussion regarding the reason behind this custom. This article will explore some of these sources and attempt to explain the origins of this custom.

The Gemara (Pesachim 100b-101a) cites a dispute between Rav and Shmuel regarding people who recite *kiddush* in shul. Rav says that they have not discharged their obligation to recite a new blessing over the wine they will drink at home, but they have fulfilled the *kiddush* obligation. Shmuel, on the other hand, argues that they have not fulfilled the *kiddush* obligation, either. The Gemara asks, according to Rav, why does the one who made *kiddush* in shul repeat it at home? The Gemara answers that it is in order to discharge the *kiddush* obligation of the members of his family.

The Gemara asks another question: According to Shmuel, who rules one cannot fulfill his *kiddush* obligation in shul, why is *kiddush* recited in shul? The Gemara answers that its purpose is to discharge the *kiddush* obligation of guests who eat and sleep in shul. The Gemara concludes that Shmuel's opinion is consistent with his reasoning elsewhere, for Shmuel rules that *kiddush* is only valid when it is recited *bimakom se'udah*, in the location of one's meal.

Tosafos (ibid. s.v. *yidei kiddush*) write that the halacha follows Shmuel. Tosafos therefore rule that *kiddush* should only be recited in shul when there are guests eating in the shul who need to hear *kiddush*; otherwise, the *kiddush* is a blessing in vain. This is also the view of the Rosh (Pesachim 10:5) and his son Rabbi Yaakov, author of the Tur (Orach Chaim 269:1).

However, there are five approaches found in the Rishonim to validate this custom even when guests are not eating in the shul.

The first approach is from Rabbeinu Nissim (Megillas Starim) cited in the Rosh (ibid.). Rabbeinu Nissim explains that if one has specific intent to eat in a different location when reciting

kiddush, it is considered *kiddush* in the place of the meal, as one's intent connects the *kiddush* to the meal. This approach is based upon a passage in the Talmud Yerushalmi (Brachos 6:6) which states that if one desires to eat in the sukkah on Shemini Atzeres, he can make *kiddush* in his home and go up to the sukkah located on the roof to eat the meal. This ruling indicates that intent to eat elsewhere can connect the *kiddush* to the meal.

The Rosh disagrees with Rabbeinu Nissim. He argues that the aforementioned Gemara in Pesachim is at odds with this Yerushalmi, for it questions the purpose of *kiddush* in shul according to Shmuel. If Rabbeinu Nissim is correct, this should not be a question, as one can fulfill the *kiddush* obligation in shul as long as he has specific intent to eat elsewhere. Furthermore, continues the Rosh, even according to the Yerushalmi specific intent will only connect the *kiddush* to the meal if the meal is eaten in the same house, as in the case of the sukkah, which is located upon the roof of the house. However, if one is planning on eating the meal in a totally separate location, this leniency would not apply. Therefore, if one makes *kiddush* in shul with specific intent to eat at home, the leniency of the Yerushalmi would not apply.

The second approach is that of Rabbeinu Yonah, also cited by the Rosh (ibid.). Rabbeinu Yonah explains that the requirement to recite *kiddush* in the place that one eats is a Rabbinic obligation, but on a Torah level this is not required. Since there are people who do not know how to make *kiddush* in their homes, the custom was to recite *kiddush* in shul to allow people the opportunity to fulfill *kiddush* on a *diOrayso* (Torah) level by listening to this *kiddush*, even though it is lacking the Rabbinic requirement of *makom se'udah*.

The Rosh argues with Rabbeinu Yonah. He writes that the statement that *kiddush* must be recited in *bimakom se'udah* implies that one has not fulfilled his obligation at all, even on a Torah level. This is because Chazal have the ability to dictate the way a mitzvah should be performed, and have the ability to lack one's fulfillment of a mitzvah, even on a *diOrayso*

level, when the Rabbinic conditions are not met. The Rosh further points out that the approach of Rabbeinu Yonah, like that of Rabbeinu Nissim, is at odds with the aforementioned Gemara in Pesachim which questions the need to recite *kiddush* in shul according to Shmuel. According to Rabbeinu Yonah, this should not be a question, as *kiddush* is recited for those who would otherwise be unable to fulfill the mitzvah of *kiddush* on their own.

The third approach is that of the Ran (Pesachim *dapei HaRif* 19b s.v. *laafukei*). He explains that the enactments of Chazal are absolute, even if their original reasoning does not apply. *Kiddush* in shul was enacted for guests who are eating in shul, but the enactment to recite it applies even when there is no such need. The Ran cites another example of an enactment that applies despite the absence of the original cause: The *Magen Avos* prayer, recited Friday night at the end of *ma'ariv*, was enacted during an era when *ma'ariv* was usually recited in the fields. This extra prayer was meant to prolong the service to allow time for everyone to complete their prayers before the bulk of the congregation would depart and leave those not yet finished alone in the fields at night. This issue has not been relevant for many centuries, yet *Magen Avos* is still recited. The Bach (Orach Chaim 269:1 s.v. *ve Kashya*) disputes this proof, since the *bracha* of *Magen Avos* was an original Rabbinic enactment, and the Sages enacted it for all situations. *Kiddush*, however, is a *diOrayso* obligation, and it became customary to recite it in shul, but there was no specific Rabbinic enactment.

The fourth approach is from the Sar Mekutzi (Rabbi Moshe of Coucy), cited in the Mordechai (Pesachim pg. 35a s.v. *kikulei*). He explains that although *kiddush* must be recited in the place that the meal will be eaten, nevertheless, one may drink from the *kiddush* wine even though the *kiddush* was not recited in the place where the meal will be eaten. This implies that *kiddush* not recited *bimakom se'udah* is not an invalid *kiddush*. Rather, it is a requirement that the Shabbos meal must be preceded by *kiddush*. There is thus no issue with reciting *kiddush* in shul, and one would recite it again before the meal. However, this opinion is unique among the Rishonim, and the other Rishonim who do not offer this solution seem to rule that a *kiddush* not recited *bimakom se'udah* is invalid.

The fifth approach is from the Ohr Zarua (1:752[9]). He explains that this *kiddush* was instituted as a public declaration of Shabbos. A similar approach is found in the Shu"t Min Hashamayim (25), where it says that this *kiddush*

was instituted to fulfill the principle of *berov am hadras melech*, "in a large crowd the King is glorified;" reciting *kiddush* publicly in shul thus glorifies G-d. The Shu"t Min Hashamayim continues that it was also instituted to teach people how to recite *kiddush* properly¹.

The Shu"t Hisorerus Teshuva (1:124) points out that the Ohr Zarua's approach seems to be at odds with the aforementioned Gemara in Pesachim, (much like the approaches of Rabbeinu Nissim and Rabbeinu Yonah). The Gemara questions the purpose of *kiddush* in shul according to Shmuel, but according to the Ohr Zarua, it has a clear purpose.

The Practical Halacha: The Shulchan Aruch (Orach Chaim 269:1) says that some have a custom to recite *kiddush* in shul on Friday night. The Shulchan Aruch concludes that it is preferable not to do so, and that the custom in Eretz Yisrael is also not to recite it. However, the Magen Avraham (ibid.:3) writes that people should make *kiddush* in shul, as the custom was established by great Torah authorities.

The Mishna Berura (273:30) points out that if one intends to fulfill his obligation by listening to the *kiddush* in shul (such as where he is indeed eating in shul), he must tell the person reciting it to have him in mind for the fulfillment of the obligation. The Sha'ar Hatzion (ibid.:34) explains that this is because nowadays, *kiddush* is only recited as a custom and not to discharge any obligations.

The Shulchan Aruch (ibid.) rules that the wine or grape juice of this *kiddush* is drunk by a minor (Shulchan Aruch ibid.). The Rema (ibid.) rules that it must be recited standing, even if one normally sits for *kiddush*. The Mishna Berura (ibid.:6) cites the Kol Bo that everyone in the congregation should stand, as well, and this spiritually provides a benefit for one's feet.

In conclusion, reciting *kiddush* in shul on Friday night is an ancient custom. Despite the somewhat unclear origins of this custom, there is firm basis for those congregations that continue to observe its practice.

¹ Shu"t Min Hashamayim (lit., Responsa from Heaven) is a compendium of answers to questions posed by Rabbi Yaakov of Corveil (12th-century France) to Heaven in his dreams. Rabbi Ovadia Yosef (Yabia Omer 1:15) points out that although Heavenly rulings do not normally play a role in the halachic process (see Bava Metziah 59b), nevertheless, since there are many opinions that validate the custom of *kiddush* in shul on Friday night, we may say that there is *siyata dishmaya*, Heavenly assistance, to further bolster the custom.

Points to Ponder:

If no minor is present to drink the wine, how much wine must be drunk by the person making kiddush?

How old must the minor drinking the kiddush wine be?

*Iyun Halacha is a publication of the Denver Community Kollel
Please consult with a qualified halachic authority for all practical questions of halacha*

Halachic Editor: Rabbi Shachne Sommers · General Editor: Rabbi Mordechai Fleisher

1395 Wolff Street, Denver, CO 80204 · 303-820-2855 · info@denverkollel.org · www.denverkollel.org

To receive Halacha Weekly by email, contact info@denverkollel.org